

2012 New Mexico/Arizona Book Award Judging Criteria

BOOK TITLE _____

AUTHOR _____

Rate each question on a scale of 1 to 5, with 5 being the highest (or best) score

COVER/APPEARANCE (25% of the Total Score): The cover and first impressions are very important to the success of every book. Does the cover attract the potential reader? Is it a measure of what is inside? Is it appropriate to the type of book?

- | | | | | | |
|-----|---|---|---|----|--|
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 1) Is the cover design pleasing and interesting in appearance? Does it evoke a positive response? Do you want to pick up the book and examine it more closely? Does the choice of colors (including b&w) stimulate interest and fit the subject? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 2) Is the cover an accurate measure of what is inside? Are the photographs or illustrations on the cover appropriate to the subject matter? Does the organization of the cover elements allow instantaneous "reading?" |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 3) Does back cover and flap (if any) design inform easily and interestingly? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 4) Are front and spine copy legible from a reasonable distance, so as to show up on a bookstore shelf? |
| Yes | | | | No | 5) Are company name or logo, and ISBN on back cover or spine or is contact information found somewhere in the book? |

TEXT/INTERIOR (25% of the Total Score): Is the type readable? Does the layout help or hinder reading of the book? Is the text consistent? Is the interior clean and clear; does it help in comprehension? Does it need proofreading and editing?

- | | | | | | |
|----|----------|-------|---|---|--|
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 6) Is the text readable (print quality as well as typestyle)? Is the interior typeface attractive, readable, and appropriate to the subject matter? Are letter spacing, line spacing, and word spacing correct and pleasing to the eye? Is it reader friendly? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 7) Does the page layout (i.e., the organization of heads, subheads, indents, and breaks in copy) facilitate reading? Is it appropriate for its audience? Is the design/layout consistent throughout? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 8) Are the photographs or illustrations on the interior appropriate, of good quality and reproduced well? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 9) Is the printing quality good throughout? Is the printing consistent throughout? |
| No | A Little | A Lot | | | 10) Does it need proofreading and editing? |

CONTENT (50% of the Total Score): Is the book well-written? Does it use appropriate language? Is it engaging? Does it hold interest?

- | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 11) Not all books fit into a bookstore or library audience. Is this book appropriate for its intended audience? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 12) Does the story engage the reader? Does it have a strong narrative format? Does it hold interest from beginning to end? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 13) If it is fiction, are the characters and plot well-developed? If non-fiction, does it provide a thorough investigation into a specific topic? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 14) Did you like/love to read this book? Was it hard to put down? |
| 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 15) Would you recommend that your friends/colleagues read this book? |

COMMENTS FOR THIS AUTHOR: (Please comment on strengths and weaknesses; provide constructive suggestions:

Judge Name/Email/Address: _____

Mailing Address: _____
(name will not be shared with entrant)

___ If this book is available after the judging process is over, I am interested in having a copy. We need your address to be able to mail it.
Please return this sheet along with the book when you are finished judging each one.

Return to: NM Book Awards, 925 Salamanca NW, Los Ranchos, NM 87107

New Mexico Book Awards

Judging Comments for the Author/Publisher

There is a space at the bottom of the scoring sheet for you to write your constructive comments regarding the judged book. This is a place for comments on the book's strong and weak points especially ones that affected the scores that you gave this book. Be sensitive but be specific. Please DO NOT write comments that are not constructive, a book review, or a book summary. Your comments may be helpful to the author and/or publisher.

You are not required to give comments, but if you do please focus on constructive suggestions.

Be right to the point as most authors and publishers appreciate candor and will probably act on your comments. For your guidance, below are a few sample comments that might help guide you.

In all cases, please enjoy the book and help us make not only the New Mexico Book Awards more helpful, but especially help the author and or publisher understand what you liked and disliked about the book.

Samples of past judges' comments:

"The book is well illustrated and easy to read but the ideas presented seem too ordinary."

"This book is a hodgepodge—too much information, too dense and trying to reach too broad an audience. I was bored right from the start."

"This book is like a warm towel, fresh out of the drier. You want to linger and wrap yourself in its warmth."

"I found the story confusing and too mystical. I think the author could have developed the relationships between the characters better."

"The story is told with heart-wrenching feeling but it would have been more enjoyable had the author spread the story of his childhood throughout the book instead of giving it to the reader in one big serving."

"Book printing leaves something to be desired -- illustrations and photos bleed through from the backside making it somewhat difficult to read or follow the text."

"The book touches on the interesting but needs more insightful questions to stimulate the reader."

"This book was entered in the CHILDRENS category but the stories are definitely not for children as they are scary, negative, and send wrong and confusing messages."

"I would have liked the story to be tighter. It seemed that there were too many events and maybe too many extraneous characters. This extra material made it harder to follow."

"The illustrations are superb and the story spellbinding but much of the text is in desperate need of major editing."

"This book told a spellbinding story and had a great ending. But, the author should seriously consider changing the cover because it is so bad and misleading that I would never have picked it up."

"Better proofreading badly needed—lots of incorrect grammar. Photos desperately need better cropping. Best part of the book are the detailed instructions on how to select and access the material."

"The humor in this book added interest to an already fascinating story. Reader will look forward to more books by this author."